1947 / 75872/154/2

1948

1948

1947 1

75872/154/2

PALESTINE.

CO-733/484/1

CLOSED UNTIL VARIOUS DATES UP TO 1979

SUBMISSION TO U.N.O.

PROPOSALS FOR THE FUTURE OF PALESTINE BY ~~VISCOUNT~~ SAMUEL

Previous				
Subsequent				
H342	18/10			
Mr Trafford Smith	25/10			
Mr D.M. Smith	25			
H342	1/4			
Mr. Mathieson	6/4			
R 342 PUT				

FILE A.

Wt. 20034,658 15,000 7/47 C. & L. 38(6)

1. P. Sec. 10. Downing St — 16.10.47 2

2. To Beith (minute by Mr. Mathieson) 17.10.47

Mr Beith came to see me with F.O. copy of PMs minute at on which Mr Bevin had minuted "Noted". P.S. at F.O. wished to send a brief note of comment on Lord Samuel's proposal to No 10. and Mr Beith asked me to provide some material. This I did, all flimsy of minute attached, with which Mr Hayford Smith indicated agreement before I passed it to F.O.

? Put by
W A C Mathieson
17/10.

Mr D M Smith

I rather think this has been settled by F.O. P.S. but if you think No 10 may be expecting anything from us, you may wish to ring them up. F.O. will of course have said that they notified

was refused by us.

? Rutty. D. 25/10

I think Fo. will have satisfied No 10.

Rutty
D. 25/10

✓

AD

1948

4

3 J. L. Pumphrey — 16.3.48

Secretary of State.

4 Viscount Samuel now sends you direct a copy of the plan he has submitted to Mr. Trygvie Lie and the Prime Minister, as an alternative to partition in Palestine.

After speaking to the Department, we would suggest that we send an acknowledgment from the Private Office saying that you have received it and read it with great interest.

24.3.48.

5 To Viscount Samuel (4 and) → 25.3.48

6 To J. L. Pumphrey (3 and) — 25.3.48

7 To Henniker (w/c 6 regd) — 25.3.48

? send for reg.

5
6

25th March, 1948.

Dear Pumphrey.

Please refer to your letter of the 16th March to Henniker enclosing Lord Samuel's letter to the Prime Minister about his alternative proposals for Palestine.

My Minister has now received a copy of this plan direct from Lord Samuel, and I enclose for information a copy of the acknowledgment which we have sent to him on the Secretary of State's instructions.

X I am copying this letter with enclosure to Henniker.

Yours sincerely,

(Sgd) W.F.Dawson.

Private Secretary.

J.L.Pumphrey, Esq.

6
5

25th March,1948.

Dear Lord Samuel,

I write to acknowledge the receipt of your letter of the 22nd March enclosing for Mr.Creech Jones a copy of the plan which you have submitted to Mr.Trygvie Lie as an alternative to partition in Palestine.

Mr.Creech Jones has asked me to thank you for your kindness in forwarding it to him. He has read it with great interest.

Yours sincerely,

(Sgd) W.F.Dawson.

Private Secretary.

The Rt.Hon.
Viscount Samuel, GCB.,GBE.

32, PORCHESTER TERRACE, W. 2.

PADDINGTON 0040.

22nd March, 1948.

Dear Colonial Secretary,

Since United Nations may now be seeking a plan for Palestine as an alternative to Partition, I ventured to send to Mr. Trygvie Lie on March 15th a letter with the Memorandum of which I enclose a copy for your information. I sent a copy at the same time to the Prime Minister, as this Paper is an amended version of one that I gave him a few months ago for possible future consideration. I also sent a copy to Dr. Weizmann in New York.

Yours sincerely,

Samuel

Rt.Hon.A. Creech Jones, M.P.

PROPOSALS FOR PALESTINE.

1. On the termination of the British Mandate, the Administration of Palestine shall be transferred to the Trusteeship Council of United Nations.

2. The Trusteeship Council will appoint a Commission to administer the country.

3. There shall be constituted in Palestine an Arab Council and a Jewish Council. Each Council will be elected by the members of the respective community wherever they may be resident, and not on a geographical basis. Each Council will make and administer laws on matters to be specified, relating to education, religion, and other communal affairs. Provision will be made for adequate revenues, to be under its own control. The Commission will consult with each Council on all matters of importance, whether communal or general, before taking action.

4. If desired by the Christian Communities there shall be constituted a third Council, with similar functions, for these Communities as a whole. Alternatively, any one of these Communities may be empowered to elect such a Council.

5. The Arab Council and the Jewish Council (and any Christian Council) shall have direct access to United Nations on any matters concerning Palestine.

6. The present system of Local Government in towns and districts shall continue.

7. Jewish immigration will be permitted as proposed in the Recommendation of the Majority Report of the U.N. Special Committee on Palestine - namely up to 150,000 in the first two years, and 60,000 a year thereafter.

8. The following unanimous Recommendations of the U.N.Commission shall be applied:

No.V: Holy Places and Religious Interests.

No.VI: Jewish Displaced Persons.

No.VII: Democratic Principles and Protection of Minorities.

No.VIII: Foreign Relations.

9. Palestine shall maintain the closest relations of social cooperation, political and economic, with the neighbouring States. In particular, unrestricted access to the sea through Palestinian ports shall be assured to the Liban State.

10
3

Mr. Watson,
Colonial Office.

With

Mr. J.L. Pumphrey's

Compliments.

10, Downing Street,
Whitehall, S.W.1.

16th March, 1948.

COPY

10, Downing Street,
Whitehall.

16th March, 1942.

With reference to the Prime Minister's minute M.371/42 of the 15th October last, I enclose a further letter which the Prime Minister has received from Lord Samuel on the subject of Palestine, together with a copy of its enclosure.

I am sending a copy of this letter and enclosure to Duncan Watson (Colonial Office).

(SGD) J.L. PUMPHREY.

J.P.L.C. Hamilton, Esq., M.C.,
Foreign Office.

COPY

32 Porchester Terrace,
W.2

15th March, 1948

Dear Prime Minister,

You may remember that a few months ago you were good enough to give me the opportunity of coming to see you about Palestine. I then left with you the draft of an alternative plan, based on Communities instead of on geographical areas, for possible consideration at some future time, if the Partition Scheme of U.N. should miscarry. As at the moment it seems probably that after May 15th, if not before, there will be open and unrestrained civil war in Palestine, I have now sent this Memorandum, amended in some minor particulars, to Dr. Trygvie Lie, in case a suggestion for a fresh approach on different lines might be of service.

I enclose a copy for your information. I am sending a copy also to Dr. Weizmann in New York.

Yours sincerely,

(SGD.) SAMUEL

Rt. Hon. C.R. Attlee, C.H., M.P.
10 Downing Street.

COPY

PROPOSALS FOR PALESTINE

1. On the termination of the British Mandate, the Administration of Palestine shall be transferred to the Trusteeship Council of United Nations.

2. The Trusteeship Council will appoint a Commission to administer the country.

3. There shall be constituted in Palestine an Arab Council and a Jewish Council. Each Council will be elected by the members of the respective community wherever they may be resident, and not on a geographical basis. Each Council will make and administer laws on matters to be specified, relating to education, religion, and other communal affairs. Provision will be made for adequate revenues, to be under its own control. The Commission will consult with each Council on all matters of importance, whether communal or general, before taking action

4. If desired by the Christian Communities there shall be constituted a third Council, with similar functions, for those Communities as a whole. Alternatively, any one of those Communities may be empowered to elect such a Council.

5. The Arab council and the Jewish council (and any Christian Council) shall have direct access to United Nations on any matters concerning Palestine.

6. The present system of Local Government in towns and districts shall continue.

7. Jewish immigration will be permitted as proposed in the Recommendation of the Majority Report of the U.N. Special Committee on Palestine - namely up to 150,000 in the first two years, and 60,000 a year thereafter.

8. The following unanimous Recommendations of the U.N. Commission shall be applied:

No. V Holy Places and Religious Interests

No. VI Jewish Displaced Persons

No. VII Democratic Principles and Protection of Minorities

No. VIII Peaceful Relations.

9. Palestine shall maintain the closest relations of cordial cooperation, political and economic, with the neighbouring States. In particular, unrestricted access to the sea through Palestine ports shall be assured to the inland States.

Mr. Beith.

You left with me yesterday the attached minute from the Prime Minister enclosing an outline of proposals for the future of Palestine ~~be~~ ~~by~~ forwarded by Lord Samuel. You asked for Colonial Office comment on these proposals which might form the basis of a letter from your Private Secretary to the Private Secretary at No. 10 in reply to the Prime Minister's minute.

Paragraphs 1 and 2 of Lord Samuel's proposals seem to us to be based on a mistaken idea of the functions of the Trusteeship Council under chapter 12 of the Charter. The basic objectives of the Trusteeship system are ~~defined~~, inter alia, as being the promotion of the political, economic, social and educational advancement of the inhabitants of the trust territories and their progressive development towards self Government or independence in accordance with their freely expressed wishes. The Trusteeship Council (under chapter 13) has no power to administer trust territories directly. It has purely supervisory functions and any extension of its functions would conflict with our present policy regarding the application of the Trusteeship system to Colonial territories. It is difficult to say how a Trusteeship Agreement designed to further the growth of the Jewish community in Palestine could be evolved within the framework of chapters 12 and 13 of the Charter.

Lord Samuel envisages the establishment in Palestine of two councils, one Arab and one Jewish. These councils are to be elected by the members of the respective communities. The proposal has much in common with the many schemes for federation which have been advanced in the past. These schemes have depended for their practicability on the readiness of the two communities to co-operate in working them. This consideration equally applies to Lord Samuel's plan. We have already announced that we are prepared to take our part in the implementation of any plan for the future of Palestine, agreeable to both Arabs and Jews. Lord Samuel's plan is therefore one which we could support. It is visionary to suppose, however, that either community could be brought to endorse it.

The plan in itself is eminently reasonable, but neither Arabs nor Jews are.

W A Nathan

17. 10. 47.

15

Mr McAlpine

10, Downing Street,
Whitehall.

16th October, 1947.

My dear Smith.

I enclose a copy of a Minute M.371/47 of the 15th October from the Prime Minister to the Foreign Secretary, and a copy of the proposals on Palestine made by Lord Samuel and referred to therein, for the information of the Colonial Secretary.

I am sending a copy of this letter to McAlpine at the Foreign Office.

Yours sincerely,

P. Sum Pakenham.

D.M. Smith, Esq.,
Colonial Office.

COPY

G. R.

16

M.371/47.

FOREIGN SECRETARY.

Lord Samuel called here in order to outline a possible alternative plan attached if U.N.O. proceedings on Palestine problem resulted in deadlock. He did not suggest that it should be put forward now, but if occassion arose it might be sponsored by himself and others with advantage. He would be prepared to discuss any points with you, if you so desire.

(Intld) C.R.A.

15th October, 1947.

PROPOSALS FOR PALESTINE

1. The government of Palestine shall be transferred to the Trusteeship Council of United Nations, and the British Mandate terminated forthwith.

2. The Trusteeship Council will appoint a Commission of three persons to administer the country.

3. There shall be constituted in Palestine an Arab Council and a Jewish Council. The Councils will be elected by the members of the respective communities wherever they may be resident, and not on a geographical basis. The Councils will make and administer laws on matters to be specified, relating to education, religion, and other communal affairs. Provision will be made for adequate revenues, to be under their own control. The Commissioners will consult with each Council on all matters of importance, whether communal or general, before taking action. The Va'ad Haleumi shall be the Jewish Council, pending any other arrangements. Elections for the Arab Council shall be held at the earliest practicable date.

4. There shall be a system of Local Government in towns and districts on the same lines as at present.

5. Jewish immigration will be permitted up to 60,000 a year, subject to the economic capacity of the country to absorb them; plus 30,000 in the first year on humanitarian grounds. This is substantially the same as Recommendation B.1(c) of the Majority Report of the U.N. Commission. [The Minority Report's Recommendation VII would also allow the re-opening of Jewish immigration. Limits would be fixed by a Special Commission, to consist of three representatives of the Palestine Arabs, three of the Palestine

Jews ....

18
END.

Jews and three of the appropriate organ of U.N.

6. The unanimous Recommendations of the U.N. Commission,

No.V: Holy Places and Religious Interests.

No.VI: Jewish Displaced Persons.

No.VII: Democratic Principles and Protection of Minorities.

No.VIII: Peaceful Relations

shall be applied.

7. Palestine shall maintain the closest relations of cordial co-operation, political and economic, with the neighbouring States. In particular, unrestricted access to the sea through Palestine ports would be assured.

8. British military forces will begin to withdraw forthwith, until, provisionally, a figure of 20,000 men is reached. A U.N. Force, consisting of contingents of not more than 2,000 men from any one country, shall be provided by such countries, and under such command, as may be decided by U.N. When this force has been established, the remainder of the British forces shall be withdrawn, except such British contingent of the U.N. Force as may have been agreed.